INNOVATIVE TECHNOLOGIES THAT ADDRESS GLOBAL HEALTH CONCERNS

OUTCOME OF THE CALL GLOBAL INITIATIVE ON HEALTH TECHNOLOGIES 2010





INNOVATIVE TECHNOLOGIES THAT ADDRESS GLOBAL HEALTH CONCERNS

OUTCOME OF THE CALL GLOBAL INITIATIVE ON HEALTH TECHNOLOGIES 2010





© World Health Organization 2010

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization can be obtained from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel.: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; e-mail: bookorders@who.int). Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to WHO Press, at the above address (fax: +41 22 791 4806; e-mail: permissions@who.int).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

Table of contents

List of abbreviations				
Ac	knowledgements	4		
1.	1. Introduction			
2.	 Background 2.1 Programme objectives 2.2 Global investment in health technology 2.3 Global Initiative on Health Technologies 2.3.1 Call for innovative technologies 	7 7 7 8 8		
3.	Call for innovative technologies 3.1 Key phases 3.1.1 Launch 3.1.2 Outreach 3.1.3 Deadline 3.1.4 Announcement of results 3.2 Screening and selection process 3.2.1 Categories 3.2.2 Reception and screening of submissions 3.2.3 Evaluation 3.2.4 Recommendation for selection	10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 11 11 11		
	 3.3 The response 3.3.1 Submissions by category 3.3.2 Global health concerns addressed 3.3.3 Country submissions 3.3.4 Intended users of submitted technologies 3.3.5 Source of submissions 3.4 Submissions 3.4.1 Submitted technologies 3.5 The selected technologies 3.5 1 Stool sample collection and preparation kit 	12 12 13 14 15 15 16 16 18 20		
	3.5.1 Stool sample collection and preparation kit	20		

	3.5.2 LED photothorapy unit	21			
	2.5.2 System for an eite production of wound irrigation colution	21			
	2.5.3 System for on-site production of would integration solution	22			
	5.5.4 Short messaging service (SWS) shoking cessation system	23			
	3.5.5 Reusable neonatal suction system	24			
	3.5.6 Fluorescence visualization of abnormalities in oral cavity	25			
	3.5.7 Iranscutaneous bilirubin measurement system	25			
	3.5.8 Isothermal nucleic acid amplification system for tuberculosis diagnosis	26			
	3.5.9 Simplified anaesthesia unit	27			
	3.5.10 Single use assistive vaginal delivery system	28			
	3.5.11 Portable on-site cell sorter and counter for HIV and malaria diagnosis	29			
	3.5.12 Decision support system for paediatric HIV	30			
	3.5.13 Transcutaneous anaemia monitoring system	31			
	3.5.14 Solar-powered autoclave	32			
	3.5.15 Portable infant warmer	33			
4.	Challenges to making innovative technologies available	34			
5.	Conclusion	36			
6.	References	37			
An	Annex 1: Rules of the call for innovative technologies 38				

List of Abbreviations

- WHO World Health Organization
- AGIT Advisory Group for Innovative Technologies
- PMD Priority Medical Devices (project)
- GBD Global Burden of Disease (study)
- MDGs Millennium Development Goals
- WHA World Health Assembly
- GDP Gross Domestic Product

Acknowledgements

The WHO call for innovative technologies was funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation within the framework of the Global Initiative for Health Technologies that was launched in 2008.

The evaluation of submitted technologies was carried out by the Diagnostic Imaging and Medical Devices unit of the Essential Health Technologies department under the direction of Adriana Velazquez, team coordinator, and Björn Fahlgren, with the support of Nicholas Adjabu, Deirdre Dimancesco, Valentina Hafner, Adham Ismail, Mattias Ivarsson, Iyad Mobarek, Jiaoru Qian, Kittie Rasmussen, Hayde Reynoso, Benjamin Schanker, Lisa Stroux, Noboru Takamura, and under the overall oversight of Steffen Groth Director of the Essential Health Technologies Department.

The contribution of the following persons and institutions has been invaluable for the evaluation of submitted innovative technologies:

Tony Easty and Anjum Chagpar from the Centre for Global eHealth Innovation, University Health Network & Institute of Biomaterials & Biomedical Engineering, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

Euroscan represented by Iñaki Gutiérrez and Sue Robinson and the following Euroscan members:

- Aurora Llanos from Agencia de Evaluación de Technologías Sanitarias de Andalucía (DETECTA), Seville, Spain;
- Maria Rosaria Perrini from Agenzia Nazionale per I Servizi sanitari Regionali (Age.na.s), Rome, Italy;
- Anne-Florence Fay from Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Committee for Evaluation and Diffusion of Innovative Technologies (CEDIT), France;
- Brendon Kearney from Australia and New Zealand Horizon Scanning Network (ANZHSN)/HPACT;
- Janet Hiller and Linda Mundy from Australian Health Technology Assessment (AHTA);
- Irving Lee and Alun Cameron from Australian Safety and Efficacy Register of New Interventional Procedures Surgical (ASERNIPS);
- Iñaki Gutiérrez Ibarluzea from Basque Office for Health Technology Assessment (Osteba), Spain;
- Andra Morrison from Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH);
- Hans-Peter Dauben from Deutsches Institut fur Medizinisches Dokumentation und Information (DIMDI);
- Dr Kees Groeneveld and Cees Postema from Health Council of the Netherlands (GR);
- Martin Flattery from Health Information and Quality Authority (HIQA), Ireland;
- Inger Norderhaug and Helene Arentz-Hansen from HTA Reviews and Dissemination Department, Norwegian Centre for Health Services Research (NOKC);
- Paul Fennessy from Integrated Care & Aged Department of Health, Victoria, Australia; and
- Claire Packer from National Horizon Scanning Centre (NHSC), England and Wales.

The support and guidance of the following experts constituting the Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies that participated in the Copenhagen meeting, where the evaluation was done, has been crucial to the outcome of the project:

José Asua, Rosa Maria Ceballos, Anjum Chagpar, Tony Easty, Iñaki Gutierrez-Ibarluzea, Josee Hansen, Tsinko Ilunga, Pascience Kibatala, Carole Longson, Joseph Mathew, Rodolphe Munoz, Noah Perin, Albert Poon, Sue Robinson, Laura Sampietro-Colom, Ludo Scheerlinck, Kathleen Sienko, Sripen Tantivess, Yot Teerawattananon, Diana Velasco.

We would like to thank Karina Reyes-Moya and Natalya Tarasenko for administrative support throughout the project.

This publication on the outcome of the call was produced by Adriana Velazquez-Berumen, Björn Fahlgren, Jennifer Barragan and Victoria Gerrard. Illustrations were provided by the applicants who submitted the selected technologies.

1. Introduction

The World Health Assembly (WHA) Resolution 60.29 on Health Technologies recognizes that medical devices are indispensable tools in health care delivery for prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation (1). It acknowledges that medical devices are essential to attain the internationally agreed health-related development goals, including those contained in the Millenium Declaration (2). It is widely accepted that the availability of, and access to appropriate and affordable health technologies in low- and middle-income countries are still insufficient.

In addition the WHA Resolution 61.21 on global strategy and plan of action on public health, innovation and intellectual property, acknowledges that (current) initiatives are not sufficient to surmount the challenges of ensuring access to, and innovation of, much needed health products and medical devices (3).

As a result of these resolutions, the World Health Organization (WHO) launched the Global Initiative on Health Technologies. Funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, the initiative's goal is to make available the benefits of core health technologies at an affordable price particularly to communities in resource limited settings in order to effectively control important health problems. This initiative includes the development of guidelines and tools for health technology management, a call for innovative technologies (the results of which are discussed in this report), and the organization of a Global Forum on Medical Devices in Bangkok in September 2010.

The call for innovative technologies that took place from September 2009 to June 2010 sought to identify and evaluate innovative medical devices (including assistive devices) either existing or under development, which address global health concerns. A total of 84 submissions from 28 countries were received by the deadline of 31 January 2010.

Following an initial screening by WHO, 68 applications were sent for evaluation by external experts. From these, 15 were selected and posted on the web site¹ of the WHO Department of Essential Health Technologies in June 2010. This report discusses the selection process of the call and presents the 15 innovative technologies deemed to hold promise in reducing the global burden of disease. It is hoped this report will foster the development and availability of these technologies, particularly for those in low- and middle-income countries. Additional information about the call, including its guidelines and scope, is available in Annex 1.

Selection of these technologies does not imply WHO endorses any particular product; WHO solely aims to draw stakeholders' attention to innovative technologies to further their development, availability, and access. Interested parties should consider this report a call for further research and evaluation of not just the technologies selected, but all others submitted that can potentially reduce the burden of disease and disability worldwide.

The challenges faced by the applicants to succeed in getting their technologies into resource-limited settings are numerous and have been detailed in the WHO report *Medical devices: managing the mismatch (4)* as well as being discussed here. Once these challenges are met with the resources from industry, academia, and other stakeholders, these and many other innovative technologies can begin to ameliorate the health and well-being of all people. To this end, WHO will continue to work in search of appropriate, affordable, and available health technologies (in particular medical devices) that can reduce the global burden of disease.

¹ http://www.who.int/medical_devices/call_selected_innovative_tech/en/index.html.

2. Background

2.1 Programme Objectives

Successful health care delivery requires effective medical devices to act as tools for the prevention, diagnosis, and treatment of diseases, as well as for rehabilitation purposes. Despite the exponential growth in scientific and technological development, low- and middle-income countries are still largely excluded from access to appropriate and affordable health technologies. Attainment of the health-related Millennium Development Goals (MDGs),¹ effective control of many diseases, and empowerment of those living with disabilities will not be possible without certain basic technologies.

The WHA Resolution 60.29 on health technologies emphasizes the role of medical devices and health technologies in health care, as well as their current suboptimal contribution to health outcomes:

"Understanding that health technologies, and in particular medical devices, represent an economic as well as a technical challenge to the health systems of many Member States, and concerned about the waste of resources resulting from inappropriate investments in health technologies that do not meet high-priority needs, are incompatible with existing infrastructures, are irrationally or incorrectly used, or do not function efficiently" *(1)*.

A strategic objective of WHO's plan for 2008–2013(5) is to ensure improved access, quality, and use of medical products including medical devices; this recognizes medical devices as tools with which to provide health care and enhance the health of people. In order to facilitate equitable access to the necessary core technologies, the WHO Department of Essential Health Technologies is tasked with identifying and promoting innovative technologies that address global health concerns and stimulating their further development.

2.2 Global investment in health technology

The Landscape analysis conducted by WHO *(6)* investigated the likelihood of any technology corporation developing or adapting technologies for global health purposes using their own funds. The following section summarizes some of the findings of that report relating to technology innovation.

Low- and middle-income countries bear a greater share of the global burden of disease than do high-income countries. In 2004, the regions of South-East Asia and Africa – comprising primarily low- and middle-income countries – bore 54% of the global disease burden, though they account for only about 40% of the world's population. Despite this inequity, low- and middle-income countries spent much less on health as a percentage of gross domestic product (GDP) than did high-income countries (7).

Since 2002 an average of 200 new technologies per year have been added to the EuroScan database for innovative health technologies *(8)*. A review of EuroScan's public access database², however, showed an apparent lack of information on technologies suitable for low-income countries.

¹ http://www.who.int/topics/millennium_development_goals/en/.

² http://www.euroscan.org.uk/

One common indicator of innovation activities is the number of new patents being registered. In terms of the country of origin the largest number of patent applications in the field of medical technology between 2001 and 2005 came from the United States of America (35%) and Japan (20%) although it is worth noting that several emerging economies such as Brazil, China, and India ranked high on the list *(9)*.

As shown through patent activities and the EuroScan database, the focus of industry is not on innovative technologies for the developing world. In order to address this gap, new strategies are required to encourage investment in health technologies that deal with challenges specifically faced in low- and middle-income countries.

2.3 Global Initiative on Health Technologies

The Department of Essential Health Technologies initiated the Global Initiative on Health Technologies¹ in March 2008. The overall goal of the initiative is to help address important health problems associated with communities in resource-limited settings by making available the benefits of core health technologies, through equitable access and affordability. This requires technology innovation, either in the technologies themselves or in the processes designed to facilitate their dissemination, application, and utilization.

The two specific objectives of the initiative are to challenge the international community to establish a framework for the development of national health technology programmes that will lower the burden of disease and ensure effective use of resources; and challenge the business and scientific communities to identify and adapt innovative technologies that can have a significant impact on improving public health in developing countries.

2.3.1 Call for innovative technologies

The call for innovative technologies challenged manufacturers, institutions, universities, governments, individuals, and non-profit organizations which design, manufacture and/or supply any type of medical device to focus their activities towards addressing the global health concerns outlined below.

- Alcohol use disorders
- Birth asphyxia and birth trauma
- Cancer
- Cerebrovascular disease
- Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
- Deficient maternal health
- Diarrhoeal diseases
- Disability
- HIV/AIDS
- Infant and child (under 5) mortality
- Ischaemic heart disease
- Lower respiratory infections
- Malaria
- Neonatal infections
- Prematurity and low birth weight
- Refractive errors
- Road traffic accidents
- Tuberculosis
- Unipolar depressive disorders

¹ http://www.who.int/medical_devices/appropriate_use/en/.

The project aims to optimize public health outcomes by encouraging innovation through:

- increasing understanding among decision-makers about the critical role of health technologies and innovation in promoting public health;
- stimulating the development of new technologies;
- promoting the use of technologies that are safe and/or simpler to use than earlier solutions;
- promoting technologies that are more cost-effective than previous technologies;
- identifying new health-related uses of existing non-health technologies that can have a significant and immediate impact on improving public health; and
- facilitating the dissemination, application, and utilization of new technologies.

3. Call for innovative technologies

3.1 Key phases

The key phases of the call for innovative technologies consisted of the launch, outreach, deadline, and announcement of results; they are detailed below. Further information regarding the call can be found on the web site of the Department of Essential Health Technologies¹.

3.1.1 Launch

WHO launched the call for innovative technologies at the World Congress on Medical Physics and Biomedical Engineering in Munich on 11 September 2009. The health concerns to be addressed and the selection criteria to be used, which were developed with assistance of the Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies (AGIT) and WHO collaborating centres for health technologies, were also presented.

3.1.2 Outreach

To disseminate the call WHO engaged in outreach activities including participation in MEDICA (the world's largest medical device trade fair), mailing information out to health technology stakeholders such as professional societies, manufacturers' umbrella organizations, and posting on health technology web sites.

3.1.3 Deadline

The deadline for submissions was 31 January 2010. In total, 84 submissions were received from 28 countries.

3.1.4 Announcement of results

A list of selected technologies was posted on the WHO web site² on 30 June 2010.

3.2 Screening and Selection Process

3.2.1 Categories

The applicants had the opportunity to submit their technology into one of two categories, based on their level of maturity.

Category 1 comprises commercialized products or products which are ready to be commercialized. This includes new products; products which have been commercialized for less than five years in high-income countries and which are not (yet) widely used in low- and middle-income countries; recent adaptation of existing non-health products for a health purpose; and/or recent adaptation of an existing medical device for low- and middle-income settings.

 $^{1\} http://www.who.int/medical_devices/call_selected_innovative_tech/en/index.html.$

² http://www.who.int/medical_devices/call_selected_innovative_tech/en/index.html.

Category 2 comprises products in a non-commercialized stage or that are not ready to be commercialized; it includes products which are under development or otherwise in a conceptual stage.

The process for screening, evaluation and selection is shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1. Overview of the screening, evaluation and selection process



3.2.2 Reception and screening of submissions

WHO only considered applications which were complete, within the scope of the call, and which were received by 31 January 2010. An identifier code was assigned to each application and all information about the applicant was removed to maintain confidentiality during the evaluation process.

3.2.3 Evaluation

The 68 anonymous applications that passed the initial screening by WHO in February 2010 were then sent to selected WHO collaborating institutions to determine how well they conformed to the selection criteria of the call and to assess their level of innovation.

The evaluation and grading process was undertaken by WHO staff, two teams of experts at Toronto University (appointed by WHO), and 14 member agencies of EuroScan during a period of approximately six weeks. All external evaluators signed confidentiality agreements. The evaluators were of different professional backgrounds including physicians, biomedical engineers, usability experts and health technology assessment specialists. The applications were graded on a scale from 1 to 5 by the evaluators solely based on the submission forms received without annexes. The grading was returned to the WHO Secretariat, which compiled the data to prepare for the selection process.

3.2.4 Recommendation for selection

The submission forms and the related grading were presented to the Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies (AGIT) by the WHO Secretariat. The AGIT was composed of experts in the field of health technologies representing a wide panel of competencies and geographical origins. Its members declared any conflicts of interest prior to participation; expert reviewers with any conflicts did not participate in the review.

In the advisory group meeting that took place 27-29 April 2010 in Copenhagen, the experts were divided into four groups, two for each category. The four expert groups reviewed the original selection as well as identified outliers. Outliers here refer to technologies that had been graded very differently by different evaluators. Each member of the group read the information provided on the application. Subsequently the groups discussed the submissions

with regard to the six selection criteria. All groups provided their recommendation for or against selection including reasoning and general comments. After reviewing all submissions, the two teams for each category presented their results to each other and engaged in further discussions. The final recommendation to the WHO Secretariat was provided in a plenary session.

Reviewers considered the following criteria when evaluating the submitted technologies:

- level of safety for the user, patient and the environment;
- effectiveness in addressing the health concern in question;
- level of adaptation to local infrastructures in resource-limited settings;
- ease of use and maintenance;
- total cost of ownership, cost-effectiveness and affordability; and
- level of cultural and social acceptability.

The major limitation identified by the experts was the difficulty to apply a single set of criteria in a consistent fashion to applications pertaining to a vast array of medical devices addressing numerous diseases and at very different levels of development.

The final selection of the 15 technologies discussed in this report was made by WHO based on the recommendations from the AGIT.

Evaluations were based solely on the information provided in the submitted documents. Therefore, further independent evaluation will be needed to ensure the successful implementation of the submitted technological innovations.

3.3 The Response

3.3.1 Submissions by category

Of the 68 submissions that passed initial screening more than 50% were commercialized or able to be commercialized (Figure 3).

Figure 3. Submissions by category: commercializable and concept technologies



3.3.2 Global health concerns addressed

Each applicant claimed that the submitted technology addressed one or more of the 19 global health concerns indicated in the scope of the call. Each applicant could select more than one health concern and a number of the products do in fact serve multiple needs within the medical sector (Figure 4).





Number of applications

3.3.3 Country submissions

Figure 5 shows the 28 countries from which technologies were submitted. Participation came from countries with diverse income levels.





Number of submissions

3.3.4 Intended users of submitted technologies

Most submissions are intended for use by health-care professionals but 14 are intended for self-use. Each applicant could select more than one intended user and it seems that most innovations can be used in multiple health care settings (Figure 6).



Figure 6. Settings for intended use of proposed technologies

3.3.5 Source of submissions

The vast majority of proposals were submitted by academia and industry; a few were also contributed by individuals and organizations specialized in innovative technologies for resource-scarce settings (see Figure 7).

Figure 7. Submissions received, by type of institution



3.4 Submissions

3.4.1 Submitted technologies

Tables 1 and 2 show the 84 submitted technologies, and reflect the variety of technologies and diversity of intended use.

Table 1. Submitted commercialized technologies or those ready to be commercialized (category 1)

Cervical cancer screening based on detection of cell membrane cancer markers in cervical smears			
Clinical decision support software			
Clinical patient data software			
Congenital disease screening system			
Diabetic foot detection system based on temperature measurement			
Diagnostic/Screening test for bladder cancer			
Digital X-ray system			
Electric stimulation neurotherapy			
Electronic health record patient interface			
Exercise kit			
External fixator			
Face masks			
Fluorescence visualization of abnormalities in oral cavity			
Fuel efficient wood stove			
Gravity-based blood separation system			
Isothermal nucleic acid amplification system for tuberculosis diagnosis			
Laryngoscope			
LED phototherapy unit			
Magnetic coils for destruction of pathogens			
Mobile laboratory for diagnosis (cardiac, cancer, respiratory)			
Mobile phone system for sending microscope images			
Multi parametric patient monitor			
Nano filters for water treatment			
Newborn simulator			
Patient data information system			
Patient management system software			
Portable haemoglobin meter			
Portable telemedicine system			
Portable ultrasound imaging system			
Portable ventilator for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease			
Radiation treatment system for health care waste			
Reusable neonatal suction system			

Rotational field quantum nuclear magnetic resonance		
Single use male circumcision device		
Short message service (SMS) for smoking cessation		
Stool sample collection and preparation kit		
System for on-site production of wound irrigation solution		
Telehealth system		
Transcutaneous bilirubin measurement system		
Ultrasound transducer disinfection system		
Vapour sterilization system		
Water dispenser for hand wash		
Web-based ECG cardiac diagnosis system		
Wheelchair based on standard components		
X-ray imaging system		

Table 2. Submitted technologies in a non-commercialized stage of development (category 2)¹

Accuracy tester for electronic fetal heart rate monitor			
Ambient gas plasma system for antisepsis			
Anti thrombotic coronary artery bypass graft			
Bio potential and impedance measurement-based monitoring for cardiovascular diseases			
Birthing simulator			
Decision support system for paediatric HIV			
Drug authentication system			
Drug packaging with extended shelf life			
External fixator			
Isolator system for minimally invasive surgery			
Laboratory in a backpack			
Micro-endoscope for cancer screening			
Mobile phone-based pregnancy risk assessment system			
Mobile phone-based pulse oximeter			
Mosquito repellent skin lotion			
Multi fever diagnosis system			
Paediatric stretcher			
Patient data information system			
Portable infant warmer			
Portable infusion system			
Portable on-site cell sorter and counter for HIV and malaria diagnosis			

¹ Two submitted applications were incomplete and one was a repeat application and are therefore not presented in the list.

Portable telemedicine system		
Remote fetal heart rate and activity monitoring		
Remote palliative radiotherapy system for terminal cancer		
Safety seat for children (road transport)		
Semi-automated system for mycobacteria detection		
Simplified anaesthesia unit		
Single use assistive vaginal delivery system		
Single use male circumcision device		
Solar reading light		
Solar-powered autoclave		
Sub-dermal implant for drug delivery		
System for biological screening to be used in current hygiene products		
Telemedicine resource for emergency care		
Transcutaneous anaemia monitoring system		
Wireless system for transmission of vital signs in neonatal intensive care units		

3.5 The selected technologies

Fifteen innovative medical devices were selected from the submissions: eight from category 1 and seven from category 2. In this section, each selected medical device is briefly introduced. Each applicant provided a poster that describes the submitted technology. Applicants' contact information is also provided to facilitate communication between the innovator and any interested parties.

The innovative technologies that were selected by the AGIT, external evaluators, and the WHO Secretariat, show potential to help reduce the global burden of disease.

Bearing in mind that the evaluation by the team of experts is solely based on the assessment of data and information submitted in the applicants' dossiers, inclusion in the Lists of Selected Innovative Technologies does not constitute a warranty of the fitness of any selected technology for a particular purpose. Besides, the responsibility for the quality, safety and efficacy of each selected technology remains with the manufacturer. The decision to list a particular technology is subject to change on the basis of new information that may become available to WHO. If there is evidence of serious safety and/or quality issues in relation to a listed technology, WHO may withdraw the technology concerned from the list until results of further investigations become available and are assessed by WHO.

WHO will not be held to endorse nor to recommend any listed technology. The Lists of Selected Innovative Technologies solely aim at drawing stakeholders' attention to innovative medical devices, either existing or under development, with a view to fostering the development and availability of, and/or access to, innovative health technologies which are likely to be accessible, appropriate and affordable for use in low- and middle-income countries.

Inclusion in the Lists of Selected Innovative Technologies does not furthermore warrant or represent that:

- 1. the list is complete or error free; and/or that
- 2. the technologies which have been found to meet the selection criteria will continue to do so; and/or that
- 3. the use of the selected technologies listed is, or will be, in accordance with the national laws and regulations of any country, including but not limited to patent laws; and/or that
- 4. any medical device or product that may be developed from selected applications will be successfully commercialized in target countries or that WHO will finance or otherwise support the development or commercialization of any such medical device or product.

WHO disclaims any and all liability and responsibility whatsoever for any injury, death, loss, damage or other prejudice of any kind whatsoever that may arise as a result of, or in connection with the procurement, distribution and/or use of any listed technology or resulting medical device or product and any future development thereof.

COMMERCIALIZABLE TECHNOLOGIES (CATEGORY 1)

3.5.1 Stool sample collection and preparation kit

The purpose of the kit is to simplify faecal examination by reducing the number of consumables and steps required for the procedure. The kit could therefore facilitate the diagnosis of parasitological diseases. Additionally, the kit does not appear to require water or electricity and is claimed to prevent contamination of the environment.



Name: José Carlos Lapenna Email: jczl@globo.com Country: Brazil

3.5.2 LED phototherapy unit

The purpose of the unit is to treat hyperbilirubinaemia in newborn infants by phototherapy. The unit could increase the safety of the procedure by using a radiation source that produces blue light and minimizes exposure to harmful ultraviolet radiation. Further potential advantages are that the unit measures the actual output of light at useful wavelengths and is claimed to have lower energy consumption than previous designs.



Name: Nancy Gambaroni E-mail: nancy.gambaroni@terra.com.br Country: Brazil

3.5.3 System for on-site production of wound irrigation solution

The purpose of the system is to produce aqueous solutions for the topical treatment of wounds and infections using a power source, dematerialized water, and salt. Solutions produced by the system could be used to treat a host of conditions including traumatic injuries, post-natal infections, and neglected tropical diseases that cause ulcerations and infections.



Name: Hermann Kranzl Email: hkranzl@gmail.com Country: Germany

3.5.4 Short messaging service (SMS) smoking cessation system

The purpose of the system is to provide tailored SMS-based smoking cessation support to its users. According to preliminary research the system facilitates self-management of smoking cessation and increases the likelihood of user adherence to smoking cessation programmes. The interactive system is claimed to be capable of answering messages about cravings to support the user.



Name: Matt Hector-Taylor Email: matt.hector.taylor@gmail.com Country: New Zealand

3.5.5 Reusable neonatal suction system

The purpose of this system is to remove obstructive mucus from the air passages of newborn infants, to reduce the risk of asphyxia, and support neonatal resuscitation. The device is claimed to be made of silicone and therefore reusable (capable of being boiled between uses). The device also requires no electricity.



Name: Jens Petter lanke Email: suctiondevice@gmail.com Country: Norway

3.5.6 Fluorescence visualization of abnormalities in oral cavity

The purpose of the system is to use the natural fluorescence of mucosal tissues when excited by a violet/blue light to inform clinicians about the presence of abnormalities in the mucosa in the oral cavity. This system could aid in the early detection of oral/oropharyngeal cancers and thereby reduce morbidity and mortality associated with these diseases.

Name: David Morgan Email: d.c.morgan@hotmail.com Country: Canada

3.5.7 Transcutaneous bilirubin measurement system

The purpose of the system is to provide an alternative to blood sample analysis for the diagnosis of hyperbilirubinaemia in newborn infants. The system uses spectral analysis of light reflected from the patient's vascular bed to determine levels of blood bilirubin. The device is claimed to be non-invasive and to provide a rapid read-out.

Name: Sue Jones Email: susan.jones115@virginmedia.com Country: France

3.5.8 Isothermal nucleic acid amplification system for tuberculosis diagnosis

The purpose of the system is to offer a point-of-care alternative to sputum smear microscopy. The technology is claimed to require no additional equipment and to yield a rapid visual read-out of the diagnostic result.



Name: Qimin You Email: qiminyou2000@163.com Country: China

CONCEPT TECHNOLOGIES (CATEGORY 2)

3.5.9 Simplified anaesthesia unit

The purpose of the unit is to function as an anaesthesia machine for surgical use in low-resource settings. The device features an innovative valve system with reduced technical complexity compared to traditional devices. The device is claimed to function with oxygen from different sources, including ambient air, and therefore would not require compressed oxygen.



Name: Mark Zimmerman Email: aygallego@gmail.com Country: Nepal

3.5.10 Single use assistive vaginal delivery system

The purpose of the system is to assist fetal extraction, in cases of prolonged second stages labour, without having to use forceps, a vacuum extractor, or to resort to caesarean sectioning. The lack of rigid instruments in the system is claimed to reduce the risk of injury to both mother and child.



Name: Odon Jorge Email: odonjorge@yahoo.com.ar Country: Argentina

3.5.11 Portable on-site cell sorter and counter for HIV and malaria diagnosis

This is a lab-on-a-chip device to monitor AIDS in HIV-infected people as well as blood cell alterations indicating malaria. The device appears to be small and portable and it is claimed to allow for rapid automated screening of a blood sample for indicators of AIDS and/or malaria.



Name: Sarah Burgarella Email: sarah.burgarella@gmail.com Country: Italy

3.5.12 Decision support system for paediatric HIV

The purpose of this system is to move away from paper-based medical records while ensuring easy and reliable access to patient-centred information. This electronic health records system is targeted at paediatric HIV cases and is intended to aid clinical decision-making processes such as weight-based dosing support for antiretroviral drugs.



Name: Sangeeta Das Bhattacharya Email: sangeeta.das.bhattacharya@gmail.com Country: India

3.5.13 Transcutaneous anaemia monitoring system

The purpose of this system is to screen populations for insufficient levels of haemoglobin in the blood and to carry out diagnosis of severe anaemia. The system is claimed to be based on spectrophotometric analysis. The device appears to be portable, non-invasive and is claimed to provide a read-out in less than a minute.



Name: Aman Midha Email: screen.anaemia@gmail.com Country: India

3.5.14 Solar-powered autoclave

This device is intended to sterilize medical instruments and is claimed to run solely on solar power. This technology could allow sterilization of medical instruments in remote areas with no access to electricity and hence reduce the risk of infections associated with performing medical interventions with unhygienic equipment.



Name: Matt Pittinger Email: solarautoclave@gmail.com Country: United States of America

3.5.15 Portable infant warmer

The purpose of this device is to improve the care of premature and low-birth-weight babies by providing a constant temperature in order to prevent hypothermia. This portable device is claimed to require no electricity and would allow for close mother-to-baby contact. The product is targeted for use in urban and rural health care settings, as well as home settings.



Name: Jane Chen Email: christinalaurenchao@gmail.com Country: United States of America

4. Challenges to making innovative technologies available

Each applicant was asked to identify any challenges they could foresee with regard to the successful implementation of their technology. Figures 8 and 9 show the challenges cited by applicants of commercialized and non-commercialised technologies respectively. A great challenge foreseen by all applicants was a lack of funding: 39% of category 1 and 83% of category 2 applicants cited this.

Distribution was also identified as a major challenge for innovations in category 1 and 2 (43% and 61% of applicants respectively; Figure 8 and 9). This is the largest concern identified by category 1 technologies, which may be due to the fact that products in this category are either on the market (or soon will be) and therefore require effective distribution channels to ensure their success. Alternatively, applicants of technologies in category 2 noted a greater need for manufacturing partners (50% compared to 14% of category 1 applicants; Figure 9 and 8 respectively), as their products are in the earlier stages of development.

Figure 8. Expected challenges to the success of innovation as described by applicants to category 1



Commercializable technologies (category 1)

Challenges

Figure 9. Expected challenges to the success of innovations as described by applicants to category 2



Concept technologies (category 2)



5. Conclusion

This report presents a selection of innovative technologies from those submitted in response to the WHO call for innovative technologies. The call is one of the ways that WHO is working to achieve its strategic objective to ensure improved access, quality and use of medical products and technologies (3). Further work is required to ensure that these innovations are accessible to those in need of them in low- and middle-income countries. In particular, further evaluation of the clinical safety and effectiveness of the technologies and assessment of their robustness and affordability is required.

Innovative technologies are necessary to increase the cost-effectiveness of health care and ease the burden of chronic diseases worldwide. However, much work remains to be done to achieve results in this domain. Specifically, stakeholders need to explore novel ways of approaching distribution and financing which are appropriate to local infrastructure.

WHO will continue to interact with industry, funding agencies, academia and international organizations to raise awareness of the need to design, produce and commercialize innovative, accessible and robust technologies which address the needs of health systems particularly in low-resource settings.

Through this first call for innovative technologies, WHO is working towards making innovative and appropriate technologies affordable and accessible in all settings to increase the quality of health care, and most importantly improve the quality of life of all people.

6. References

- 1. Resolution WHA60.29. Health technologies. In: Sixtieth World Health Assembly, Geneva, 23 May 2007. Geneva, World Health Organisation, 2007 (http://www.who.int/medical_devices/resolution_wha60_29-en1.pdf, accessed 29 November 2010).
- 2. 55/2. United Nations Millennium Declaration, United Nations, 8th September 2000 (http://www.un.org/ millennium/declaration/ares552e.htm, accessed 7 December 2010))
- Resolution WHA61.21. Global Strategy and plan of action on public health, innovation and intellectual property. In: Sixty-first World Health Assembly, Geneva, 24 May 2008. Geneva, World Health Organisation, 2008 (http:// apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/A61/A61_R21-en.pdf, accessed 7 December 2010)
- 4. Hansen J. et al. *Medical devices: managing the mismatch: an outcome of the priority medical devices project.* Geneva, World Health Organisation, 2010 (http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2010/9789241564045_eng. pdf, accessed 29 November 2010).
- World Health Organisation. Medium term strategic plan 2008-2013 and programme budget 2008-2009. Geneva, World Health Organisation, 2008 (http://apps.who.int/gb/e/e_amtsp.html, accessed 29 November 2010).
- 6. World Health Organisation. Landscape analysis: Determine the likelihood of any technology corporation developing or adapting technologies for global health purposes using their own funds. Geneva, World Health Organisation, in press, December 2010.
- 7. Lopez AD et al., eds. Global burden of disease and risk factors. New York, World Bank and Oxford University Press, 2006.
- 8. [Anonymous]. EuroScan Developments. EuroScan International Network, Newsletter No. 5, (Birmingham), November 2008:4.
- World intellectual Property Organisation. Patent applications by field of technology (2001-2005 average) by country of origin and leading countries [online database]. World Intellectual Property Organization Statistics Database, 2002 (http://www.wipo.int/export/sites/www/ipstats/en/statistics/patents/xls/wipo_pat_filings_ technology_origin.xls, accessed 2 July 2009).

Annex 1: Rules of the call for innovative technologies

1. Background and Aim of the Call

Medical devices are indispensable in health care delivery as tools for prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation. However, despite the exponential growth of scientific and technological development, availability of and access to appropriate and affordable health technologies in low- and middle-income countries are still insufficient.

One of the WHO Department of Essential Health Technologies' goals is to help make available the benefits of core health technologies with a view to addressing global health concerns by developing a framework for health technology programmes and by challenging the scientific and business community to identify and develop innovative technologies.

This call for innovative technologies aims at identifying and evaluating innovative medical devices, including assistive devices, either existing or under development, which address global health concerns and which are likely to be available, appropriate and affordable for use in low- and middle-income countries.

Selected innovative technologies will be highlighted on the WHO Essential Health Technologies website. They will be shared with governments, donors and other stakeholders, with a view to generally fostering the development, availability of and access to innovative health technologies, particularly in low- and middle-income countries.

2. Key Dates

11 September 2009	Launch of the call for innovative technologies at the World Congress on Medical Physics and Biomedical Engineering, Munich ¹ .
31 January 2010	Deadline for submission of applications.
27–29 April 2010	Selection of applications by the Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies, Copenhagen.
30 June 2010	Posting of the list of selected innovative technologies on the WHO website ² .

1 http://www.wc2009.org/World-Congress-2009/Pages/Home.aspx

3. Eligibility

3.1 Who can apply

The call for innovative technologies targets manufacturers, institutions, universities, governments, individuals and non-profit organizations which design, manufacture and/or supply any type of medical device that address the global health concerns mentioned in section 5. One submission per applicant will be accepted.

4. The Scope of Innovative Technologies

4.1 Medical Devices

Eligible health technologies are limited to medical devices as defined by the Global Harmonization Task Force (GHTF)³. They include instruments, medical equipment, implants, disposables, assistive devices and software used mainly for the purpose of prevention, diagnosis, monitoring or treatment of disease, rehabilitation, control of conception and/or measuring, restoring correcting physiological functions.

The call for innovative technologies does not cover clinical procedures, medicinal products, vaccines, biological therapeutic products or tissue engineered medical products.

4.2 Innovative Technologies

To qualify for consideration, a technology must be deemed "innovative" by providing the evidence that the solution:

- Has not previously existed;
- Has not previously been made available in low- and middleincome countries;
- Is safer and/or simpler to use than earlier solutions; and/or
- Is more cost effective than previous technologies.

4.3 Two Categories

Category 1 Commercialized/-sable products

- New products
- Products which have been commercialized for less than five years in high-income countries and which are not (yet) widely used in low- and middle-income countries
- Recent adaptation of existing non-health products for a health purpose
- Recent adaptation of an existing medical device for low- and middle-income country settings

Category 2 Products in a non-commercialized/-sable stage

 Products which are under development or otherwise in a conceptual stage

² http://www.who.int/medical_devices/en/

³ http://www.ghtf.org/documents/sg1/sg1n29r162005.pdf

5. The Health Problems to be Addressed

The health problems addressed by the innovative technologies should be related to the following key global health concerns:

- Lower respiratory infections
- Diarrhoeal diseases
- HIV/AIDS
- Malaria
- Prematurity and low birth weight
- Neonatal infections
- Birth asphyxia and birth trauma
- Unipolar depressive disorders
- Ischemic heart disease
- Cerebrovascular disease
- Tuberculosis
- Road traffic accidents
- Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
- Alcohol use disorders
- Refractive errors
- Deficient maternal health
- Infant and child (under 5) mortality
- Cancer
- Disability.

6. Submission of Applications and Deadline

Interested applicants can download the submission form from: www. who.int/medical_devices. The applications should be completed in English, signed, scanned and e-mailed as a PDF document to medicaldevices@who.int.

Deadline for applications is 31 January 2010. Receipt of applications will be confirmed by e-mail.

7. Screening and Selection

Step 1 — WHO will screen all applications. The ones which are incomplete will, in principle, not be processed further. An identifier code will be assigned to the application and all information about the applicant will be removed to maintain confidentiality.

Step 2 — Applications without identification data will be sent to selected WHO collaborating institutions for a second screening with respect to conformity to the scope of the call for innovative technologies. Those applications which do not fall within the scope of the call will not be sent to the selection committee, the so-called Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies.

Step 3 — Proposals are evaluated and selected by the Advisory Group on Innovative Technologies, which is composed of experts in the field of health technologies. A confidentiality agreement will be signed by the members of such Advisory Group. Any expert reviewer with a declared conflict of interest will not be authorized to participate in the review.

8. Selection Criteria

The following considerations will be taken into account in the selection of the applications:

- Level of safety for user, patient and the environment;
- How effectively the technology addresses the related health concern;
- How well the technology is adapted to local infrastructures in resource-limited settings;
- Ease of use and maintenance;
- Total cost of ownership, cost-effectiveness and affordability; and
- Cultural and social acceptability of the technology.

9. Notification

Each applicant will be notified in writing (by e-mail) in June 2010 whether or not the submission has been selected. A list of the selected innovative technologies will then be posted on the WHO web site.

10. Terms, Conditions and Disclaimers

WHO reserves the right not to select any application or to annul the solicitation process at any time, without thereby incurring any liability or any obligation to inform the applicants of the grounds for the WHO's action. WHO reserves the right, at any time during the solicitation process, to modify the scope of the call. At any step in the evaluation process, WHO reserves the right to issue an amendment to the call detailing the change to only those applicants who have not been officially eliminated at that point in time. Applications will be evaluated by WHO, in collaboration with partner experts and institutions, in its sole discretion, taking into account the criteria outlined above. There is no obligation by WHO to reveal, or discuss with any applicant, how a submission was assessed, or to provide any other information relative to the selection process.

Incomplete applications and applications submitted after the deadline will, in principle, be disregarded, unless WHO in its sole discretion, decides otherwise in respect of such incomplete or late application. WHO may request applicants to submit complementary or additional information as a condition for consideration. Any possible requests to submit complementary information and/or to submit a more detailed application, as well as any discussions ensuing there from, will be exploratory only, and do not mean that the applicant concerned will be selected.

WHO will not be held to offer applicants any explanation or justification as to why their proposal has been rejected and/or why they have not been selected. The list of selected applications will not necessarily be made public as such. The submission of applications, the subsequent selection process and outcome of the selection process will not be subject to any claim of any kind whatsoever, or appeal. Each applicant will be notified in writing by WHO (by e-mail) whether or not the submission has been selected.

Any and all costs and expenses incurred in relation to, or ensuing from, the submission of an application (including the possible complementary information and/or a more detailed proposal, if so requested by WHO) will not be subject to claims for financial compensation of any kind whatsoever.

WHO does not warrant that any medical devices, innovations, concepts or products that may be used, identified or otherwise developed from selected proposals will be successfully commercialized in target countries, or that WHO will finance or otherwise support the development or commercialization of any product. By selecting applications, WHO will not be held to endorse any product but will solely aim at drawing stakeholders' attention to innovative technologies, either existing or under development, with a view to furthering development and availability of, and access to, such innovative health technologies.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products at any stage of the selection process or subsequently will not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by WHO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned, nor that they have been found to be safe and efficacious.

Without WHO's prior written approval, selected applicants shall not, in any statement of an advertising or promotional nature, refer to their selection under this call for innovative technologies. In no case shall selected applicants use the name or the emblem of the World Health Organization, or any abbreviation thereof, in relation to their business or otherwise. The same applies to all applicants during the selection process and thereafter.

www.who.int/medical_devices

Department of Essential Health Technologies

World Health Organization 20 Avenue Appia CH-1211 Geneva 27 Switzerland Tel: +41 22 791 1239 E-mail: medicaldevices@who.int http://www.who.int/medical_devices/en/